

Eliminating the use of points in favor of rank in band contests-Submitted by Erin Gunn,
WUSPBA Executive Secretary

CURRENT WORDING:

7.10. Determination of Band Contest Results: Judging will be performed by a panel of one or two piping judges, one ensemble judge, and one drumming judge. Each judge will award a band a numerical score of between zero (0) and one hundred (100) points based upon that judge's evaluation of the bands performance. Judges shall not award the same numerical score to more than one band.

The contest organizer shall form a Tally Committee whose responsibilities will be the verification of judge's scores and tabulation of the contest results. The Tally Committee should not contain any members of a band that has taken part in the contest being tabulated. The Tally Committee should include the WUSPBA Representative for the appropriate WUSPBA Branch, or their designated representative.

The Tally Committee will determine the rank of the bands from the highest score to the lowest score according to each judge's respective numerical score. The Tally Committee will record the score and the rank for each band according to each judge. If the contest uses a single piping judge the score and rank for the piping judge will be duplicated and assigned to the values for the second piping judge. The rank of the two piping judges, the ensemble judge and the drumming judge will be added together. The overall band placement will be determined by the lowest sum of these values. If two bands tie after this sum is determined the result of the tie will be broken by giving preference to the rank as determined by the ensemble judge.

Band	Piping 1		Piping 2		Ensemble		Drumming		Total
	Score	Rank	Score	Rank	Score	Rank	Score	Rank	
Band A	68	4	71	3	65	4	69	4	15
Band B	74	3	70	4	67	3	72	1	11
Band C	81	1	72	2	70	2	71	2	7
Band D	80	2	73	1	71	1	70	3	7

Example 1. An example of a judging panel using two piping judges

In Example 1, a two piping judges were used. "Band C" and "Band D" are tied with 7 points. Since "Band D" was the first place according to the ensemble judge, "Band D" has won this contest. "Band C" was the second place band; "Band B" was the third place band; "Band A" was the fourth place band.

Band	Piping 1		Piping 2		Ensemble		Drumming		Total
	Score	Rank	Score	Rank	Score	Rank	Score	Rank	
Band A	68	4	68	4	65	4	69	4	16
Band B	74	3	74	3	67	3	72	1	10
Band C	81	1	81	1	70	2	71	2	6
Band D	80	2	80	2	71	1	70	3	8

Example 2. An example of a judging panel using a single piping judge

In Example 2, a single piping judge is used, so the values for the two judges are identical (notice the italicized entry). “Band C” has won this contest. “Band D” was the second place band; “Band B” was the third place band; “Band A” was the fourth place band.

PROPOSED WORDING:

7.10. Determination of Band Contest Results: Judging will be performed by a panel of one (1) or two (2) piping judges, one (1) ensemble judge, and one (1) drumming judge. **Each judge will award a rank to all bands entered into a single event;** based upon their evaluation of the bands performances. No ties are allowed.

The contest organizer shall form a tally committee whose responsibilities will be the verification of Judge’s **rankings** and tabulation of the contest results. The tally committee should not contain any members of a band that has taken part in the contest being tabulated. The tally committee should include the WUSPBA Representative for the appropriate WUSPBA branch, or their designated representative.

The tally committee will record the rank for each band, from each judge. If the contest uses a single piping judge, the rank will be recorded for both the piping 1 and piping 2 judges. The rank of the two piping judges, the ensemble judge, and the drumming judge will be added together. The overall band placement will be determined from the lowest sum to the highest sum of these rankings. If two bands tie after this sum is determined the result of the tie will be broken by giving preference to the rank given by the ensemble judge.

Band Name	Piping 1 Rank	Piping 2 Rank	Ensemble Rank	Drumming Rank	Sum of Rank	Overall Placement
Band A	4	3	4	4	15	4
Band B	3	4	3	1	11	3
Band C	1	2	2	2	7	2
Band D	2	1	1	3	7	1

Example 1. An example of a judging panel using two piping judges

In Example 1, two piping judges were used. Band C and Band D are tied with a sum of 7. Using the rank given by the ensemble judge, band D won the contest. Band C was placed second, Band B placed third, and Band A was placed fourth.

Band Name	Piping 1 Rank	Piping 2 Rank	Ensemble Rank	Drumming Rank	Sum of Rank	Overall Placement
Band A	4	4	4	4	16	4
Band B	3	3	3	1	10	3
Band C	1	1	2	2	6	1
Band D	2	2	1	3	8	2

Example 2. An example of a judging panel using a single piping judge

In Example 2, a single piping judge was used, so the rank for the piping 1 and piping 2 judges is identical.

Rational:

Often times the points awarded to bands are arbitrary and inconsistent from one adjudicator to another. By eliminating the use of points and allowing adjudicators to simply place the bands potential errors in the processing and tabulation of the adjudicator rankings are also eliminated.

Additional Action Required:

Band judging sheets and contest tabulation sheets will need to be re-designed to reflect this contest rule. Adjudicators will need to be informed of the change in procedure.